# RJIB

### RETORIKA: Jurnal Ilmu Bahasa

Vol. 9, No. 3 December 2023, Page 448-456

P-ISSN: 2406-9019 E-ISSN: 2443-0668

Available Online at https://ejournal.warmadewa.ac.id/index.php/jret

### Challenges Faced by Participants in the In-Service Teacher Certification Programme

Ni Putu Meita Subudiasih<sup>1\*</sup>, Putu Suarcaya<sup>2</sup>, Ni Putu Era Marsakawati<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1, 2, 3</sup>Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha
<sup>1\*</sup>meita@undiksha.ac.id, <sup>2</sup>putusuarcaya@gmail.com, <sup>3</sup>eramarsakawati@gmail.com

Published: 30/12/2023

### How to cite (in APA style):

Subudiasih, N. P. M., Suarcaya, P., Marsakawati, N. P. E. (2023). Challenges Faced by Participants in the In-Service Teacher Certification Programme. *RETORIKA: Jurnal Ilmu Bahasa*, 9(3), 448-456. Doi: 10.55637/jr.9.3.7566.448-456

Abstract-In order to better equip teachers for the profession, this research looks at the difficulties encountered by those who take part in Indonesia's Teacher Professional Education Program (PPG). The purpose of this research is to learn about the difficulties encountered by PPG members and the strategies they used to overcome them. A qualitative technique is utilized in this study's methodology. Ten teachers who had finished the PPG program at Ganesha University of Education in 2020 were involved in this research. In this study, internet interviews served as the data collection tool. There were five steps to the data processing process in this study: reading, transcribing, highlighting, keywords, and categorization. Problems with technology adoption and insufficient technical knowledge were identified as difficulties experienced by PPG members in this survey. not having a complete grasp of software expertise, being confused when selecting assessment tools, and having trouble creating lesson plans. Participants work on their problem-solving skills by studying on their own or using the YouTube app. The study's findings suggest that participants might utilize their experiences with the obstacles they faced to better prepare for the future of technology in online education.

Keywords: PPG, Teacher Professional Qualifications, Challenges, Strategy (Way)

### I. INTRODUCTION

The teacher certification program (PPG) is an important government initiative in Indonesia to improve the professional qualifications of teachers. This program aims to equip teachers with the necessary skills and knowledge to identify and solve learning problems faced by students in schools. The program also focuses on developing teachers' ability to evaluate their own performance and apply the knowledge and skills acquired during the program.

PPG programs that previously took place offline or outside the network have changed to online PPG programs. This is due to the Covid-19 pandemic and resulted in the education program taking place online. The impact of

changing the PPG implementation system is very large for teachers, because teachers are directly dealing with technology. The occurrence of an online PPG implementation system certainly raises new challenges for participants. Moreover, participants who do not know or are skilled in applying technology. Some of the challenges faced by participants in online learning can include mastering various teaching technologies, adapting to online interactions, and managing time effectively. However, these challenges may vary depending on individual circumstances and level of technological literacy.

Interactions with PPG graduates revealed that, following the distribution of training materials by PPG instructors, graduates felt more

prepared to carry out their responsibilities. This image of self-assurance develops as a result of their growing competence in areas connected to their responsibility for developing instructional materials and selecting appropriate assessment instruments. Making and editing instructional films was a breeze for PPG participants, and they got to pick the social media site where they could share their finished products. The presence of this position suggests that the teacher's identity undergoes transformation upon enrolling in the PPG program.

Online delivery of the PPG (Teacher Preparation Guidance) program began in 2020. Because of this and other concerns linked to the COVID-19 epidemic, the teacher certification program is now conducted entirely online. Naturally, this approach presents a challenge to participants as it requires them to engage in online interactions and become proficient in a variety of forms of instructional technology.

Lokita (2018) has already addressed the difficulties encountered by PPG members when engaging in online education. Case studies form basis of this research's the qualitative methodology. According to the findings, PPG members encounter difficulties while trying to use technology. Participant incompetence with information and communication technology (ICT), uploaded modules that aren't fully functional, teacher ignorance of learning software, and an overwhelming number of tasks to finish in a short amount of time are all obstacles. Researchers saw the findings of this study and went on to perform more experiments that used alternative approaches to refer to earlier investigations. The content analysis model serves as the foundation for the researchers' methodology. The purpose of this is to learn about the difficulties encountered by those pursuing teacher certification and the strategies they used to overcome those difficulties.

### II. METHODS

Transcripts served as the primary data source for this qualitative study, which relied on an inductive content analysis paradigm (Bori, 2020). This methodology allows for the interpretation and understanding of the content's examined meaning through a sentence-bysentence analysis. Ten educators from Ganesha University of Education's 2020 PPG program participated in this study. They had been contacted again and invited to do self-reflection

regarding the learning process that has been carried out. In addition, they were also be invited to reflect on how PPG is able to facilitate teachers in seeing the learning process comprehensively. Following this, they discussed the challenges faced while attending PPG online.

Data collection was carried out using an online interview instrument. This interview was conducted to find out more about how teachers see themselves in their capacity as educators who already hold educator certificates. In addition, this online interview also aims to find out the challenges faced by teachers while they are making learning videos. The data instrument in this study used an interview guide. The procedure is by way of the researcher interviewing PPG participants online. Then the researcher analyzed the results of the online interview recordings. The recordings analyzed are 5 recordings with a duration of 30 to 40 minutes. The details of the duration are 32.44 minutes of recording for module 5, recording of module 6 with a duration of 38.04 minutes, recording of module 7 with a duration of 40 minutes, recording of module 8 for 2 times with a duration of 33 and 34 minutes. In analyzing the data, the technique that will be used is content analysis. This content analysis consists of five stages, namely transcripts, readings, highlights, keywords, and categories. For further explanation will be explained as follows:

### 2.1 Transcript

At this stage the researcher focused on the transcripts of 5 video zoom results from recorded online interviews with PPG participants. At the stage of making video transcripts, the researcher looked at the zoom recordings one by one 2 times. Then re-watch one of the recordings and slowly transcribe the contents of the video into words. Then it is supervised again to check the suitability of the contents of the recording with the results of the copy in word. This step is repeated for the other four video recordings.

### 2.2 Reading

The second stage is reading, after finishing making a transcript of the 5 zoom video recordings, the researcher re-reads the entire transcript to understand more deeply the contents of the video.

### 2.3 Highlight

At this stage the researcher highlights the important parts that have been made at the

transcript stage. After reading the transcript, the researcher wrote down the important parts emphasized by the researcher. These parts are like the challenges faced by PPG teachers in making learning videos.

### 2.4 Keywords

The next step is keywords. At this stage the researcher focuses on searching for keywords from the transcript. The keywords that the researcher focused on in this study were the challenges faced by teachers participating in online PPG.

### 2.5 Categories

After searching for keywords, the researcher creates categories. At this stage the researcher categorizes things that are included in the challenges faced when participating in PPG and the challenges faced by PPG teachers in making learning videos. This categorization stage is important to find out the challenges faced by PPG participating teachers as well as the challenges in making and editing learning videos.

# III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION 3.1 Result

# 3.1.1 Challenges Faced by Participants in PPG online

This research examines the challenges faced in participating in the Teacher Education Professional Program (PPG) at the Ganesha University of Education, Singaraja. In addition, PPG program participants are also faced with finding solutions to these challenges. A job is based on the demands of professionalism, which describes the requirements that must be possessed by someone who holds that position. Howsam in Mantja identifies a profession as follows: (1) A professional uses his time fully to carry out his work; (2) A professional is bound by the things in his position and in that case requires a set of compliance and behavior norms; (3) Become an official/formal professional member; (5) Mastering useful knowledge and skills on a very special educational basis; (6) Bound competency requirements, bv achievement awareness and dedication; and (7) Obtaining autonomy based on high technical specialization. Teachers benefit personally by becoming more professional, and society as a whole benefits from their efforts to raise the bar for classroom instruction. The importance of a

teacher's professional certificate (certification) cannot be overstated in today's world. Earning this credential entitles educators to perks including professional development grants.

PPG is carried out at the Ganesha University of Education, namely using the online method (online/online). Given that at the time of implementation there was an outbreak of Covid-19 which required educators and students to carry out educational activities online or remotely. In implementing the PPG program through online learning, participants are guided to learn in two ways. The first is independent study mode and the second is guided learning mode. Independent learning is ensured by various performance records that must be completed and submitted within a certain period of time. Guided learning is carried out using the concept of development and guidance in understanding modules and other learning resources that are uploaded to discussion forums. Online learning systems are reducing sitting time in traditional face-to-face courses and shifting to online course delivery. Participants can learn multimedia-enhanced content through channels for ongoing discussion.

However, there are several challenges in implementing online learning for working teachers that need to be underlined. Participants share their reflections on barriers to technology adoption and lack of skills in technology. In addition, participants also admitted that they did not fully understand software knowledge. Then confusion in choosing tools for evaluation questions and difficulties in preparing lesson plans. From the results of an analysis of the contents of informal interviews with PPG participants, 4 challenges were identified in implementing online learning.

### 3.1.1.1 Lack of Participants' ICT skills

Online learning requires the ability to recognize more deeply about new technologies. If participants are not as tech-savvy as their more tech-savvy counterparts, the mentor should be able to help them. Some participants admitted that they did not have qualified IT skills. Some of them do not yet have sufficient basic computer skills to carry out online learning effectively. These participants often need the help of a mentor in such matters. In addition, participants also considered themselves lacking in applying technology skills. Like for example they don't know about video editing applications and how to edit them and also have difficulty uploading videos. This is also supported by the results said by Mr. Alex Raden: Excerpt 1: "Before I didn't know how to edit a video then how to add the video to my YouTube account and this was a challenge for me".

In addition, Dewinta Putri's mother also said the same thing, she revealed her shortcomings in the field of technology.

Excerpt 2: "To edit the video was the first thing for me and I had a lot of trouble because I just edited the video before."

Furthermore, Ms. Dian Utama also found it difficult to enter questions into the CBT computer.

Excerpt 3: "My difficulty is how to compose this question into the cbt computer and this is a new challenge for me even though the preparation of the questions is not difficult for me."

Thus, they contact their mentor through the WhatsApp social network for technical assistance. These repetitive technical problems lead to demotivation, which reduces student engagement in learning. In this case, Vonderwell & Zachariah (2005) found that students' technological abilities affect student engagement and reflective focus on learning. From the above, this study found that a lack of technological skills was a challenge faced by online PPG participants.

# 3.1.1.2 Teacher's Ignorance of Educational Software

The Indonesian government offered mentors technical assistance before the PPG program began for in-service teachers via an online learning format. This mentor is in charge of providing guidance to the chosen university mentor. This method of training from the top down uses a cascade model, where the trainer from one group is taught a specific skill or body of information and then, after qualifying, is asked to teach the second group. According to Jacobs (2002). The purpose of technical instruction is to provide online instructional information and skills using software and its applications. Then the mentor applies it and guides PPG participants regarding applications in the software. However, in the implementation of online PPG there are several obstacles. Such as the teacher's ignorance of the types of software applications that can be used to support learning. This is also supported by the results said by Mr. Alex Raden, Mrs. Dewinta Putri, and Mrs. Maria.

Excerpt 4, Mr. Alex Raden: "I don't know what Zoom is like, and what Google Meet is like because this device is something new for me in learning it as well as a new challenge for me."

CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0 License

Excerpt 5, Mrs. Dewinta Putri: "This is the first time I'm learning to use Google Meet, Google Zoom, Google Forms, and so on."

Excerpt 6, Mrs. Maria: "This is the first time I'm learning to use Google Meet, Zoom and so on." From the above, the use of software is a new challenge for online PPG participants. This is considered because of their ignorance of the software and application implementation in it.

# 3.1.1.3 Confused about Choosing Evaluation Questions

Many participants felt confused in choosing questions to evaluate their students. For example, they have to choose evaluation questions in the form of essays, fill in the blanks, true-false or choice. Participants reported that they were confused and did not understand what evaluation questions were asked so that the evaluation results were relevant. As Pak Deni said in the following excerpt:

Excerpt 7: "From my experience making computer-based evaluation questions, I think one of the things that is confusing is actually choosing the type of evaluation. What should be developed, whether it is a choice essay, fill in the blank, true or false, of course it will readjust to the computer-based material itself when it comes to choose questions. Basically, what I remember and know in compiling the evaluation must be valid and reliable. want to test the conditional sentence, so that the evaluation is related to the conditional sentence, so that it can be said to be valid?"

Apart from that, Buk Maria also revealed the difficulty in choosing tools for evaluation questions. This is supported in the following quotation

Excerpt 8: "I also experienced problems in learning evaluation. What tools should I use to date? Which is roughly." Mr. Rizad also agreed with Buk Maria regarding the confusion in choosing evaluation questions, but here he tried to use the Google form. This can be supported by what Mr. Rizad said

Excerpt 9: "I also feel challenged in choosing evaluation questions, sir, and here I try to use the Google form"

From the quotation above, it can be seen that the participants were confused and felt challenged in choosing the evaluation question tool to be entered into the CBT computer and were still unsure about the validity of the questions.

# 3.1.1.4 Difficulties in Preparing Online Lesson Plans

Several participants admitted that they had

difficulty in compiling lesson plans online. Many of them are used to compiling lesson plans offline (outside the network). So, they feel stiff and have difficulty in compiling lesson plans using software (online). As stated in the following excerpt:

Excerpt 10: "The newest thing for me is compiling all the tools for compiling lesson plans that are done online. Usually we, we make it for off-network for this online. The first thing that made it difficult for me was that I was new to applications like Google meet Google form and so on."

# **3.1.2** The Way of PPG Participants Solve Challenges

In facing various challenges, of course there is a way to solve them. The method used is of course different from the size of the challenge. Moreover, a student who is required to have professionalism must of course be prepared for the challenges faced as well as prepare ways to solve these challenges. In this study, several challenges were encountered by participants participating in the Teacher Professional Education (PPG) as explained in 4.1. How do PPG participants face these challenges? The following will explain one by one.

# 3.1.2.1 PPG Participants Lacking in ICT Skills

Online learning requires the ability to recognize more deeply about new technologies. If participants are not as tech-savvy as their more tech-savvy counterparts, the mentor should be able to help them. Some participants admitted that they did not have qualified IT skills. Some of them do not have sufficient basic computer skills. As revealed by Mr. Alex Raden in the results of the following reflection:

Excerpt 11: "Before that, I didn't know how to edit a video and how to add the video to my YouTube account, and I also lacked skills in using technological tools."

Then Mrs. Dewinta Putri and Mrs. Dian Utama admitted that they were not skilled enough in using technology. They solved the problem by exploring the use of technology tools through YouTube and talking to colleagues who know more about this.

# 3.1.2.2 Participants Who Do Not Know about Applications in Educational Software

The implementation of PPG online is of course related to software in which various

applications are available that can be used to support the running of PPG online. These applications include Google Forms, Google Zoom, and Google Meet. PPG participants admitted that they were not very familiar with these applications, some of them even did not know anything about them. However, as PPG progresses, they face this problem by searching the internet for ways to use the application. Apart from that, they also discuss with each other what needs to be done and of course this cannot be separated from the mentor's guidance.

# 3.1.2.2 Confusion of Participants in Choosing Evaluation Questions

PPG participants in their reflection reported to the mentor that they were confused and did not understand what evaluation questions were given to their students so that the evaluation results were relevant. However, these challenges can be completed properly by the participants. Participants admitted that they studied evaluation questions from YouTube and the internet. As stated by one of the representatives of the participants, Mrs. Dian Utama as follows;

Excerpt 12:"How many days have I learned this through YouTube". Therefore, they can make evaluation questions so that the results of the questions become relevant.

# 3.1.2.3 Participants Have Difficulty in Preparing Online Lesson Plans

Several participants admitted that they had difficulty in compiling lesson plans online. Many of them are used to compiling lesson plans offline (outside the network). So, they feel stiff and have difficulty in compiling lesson plans using software (online). PPG participants can successfully complete challenges by discussing with fellow colleagues, asking mentors for help, and searching via the internet and YouTube.

### 3.2 Discussion

# 3.2.1 Challenges Faced by Participants in PPG Online

In this discussion it was found that there were 4 challenges faced by online PPG participants at Ganesha University of Education, Singaraja. These challenges are Lack of participants' ICT skills, teacher's ignorance of educational software, confused about choosing evaluation questions, and difficulties in preparing online lesson plans. In implementing PPG online, of course, technology is a challenge that is often faced by PPG participants.

### 3.2.1.1 Lack of participants' ICT Skills

Researchers discovered the challenges faced

by PPG participants in technological skills. Participants admitted that they did not have good skills in terms of technology. This is a crucial issue for researchers because the use of technology is the main thing in implementing PPG online. However, PPG participants were not yet skilled in utilizing technology. The first participant mentioned his ignorance technology by saying "Before I didn't know how to edit a video then how to add the video to my YouTube account and this was a challenge for me". Then the second participant said "To edit the video was the first thing for me and I experienced a lot of problems because I had just edited the previous video." And finally, the third participant said "My difficulty is how the preparation of this question enters the cbt computer and this is a challenge new for me even though the preparation of the questions is not difficult for me.

Technology is a major component in carrying out online activities, in this case carrying out the PPG program online. Associated with of this, Vonderwell (2005) states that technological skills influence a person's level of participation and their reflective focus in the course. This study found that the lack of participants' ICT skills is one of the challenges of implementing the program online. From this research we know that technology has an important role for both teachers and students. Especially in carrying out educational programs online.

# 3.2.1.1.1 Teacher's Ignorance of Educational Software

The second challenge found in this study was teacher/participant ignorance of educational software. Several participants in the Teacher Professional Education admitted that they did not know about software and applications that could be used in educational programs, especially in implementing online programs. As stated by participant 4 "I don't know what Zoom is like, and what Google Meet is like because this device is something new for me in learning it as well as a new challenge for me."

Then participant 5 also said the same thing: "This is the first time I have learned to use Google Meet, Google Zoom, Google Forms, and so on." And finally, the 6th participant: "This is the first time I'm learning to use Google Meet, Zoom and so on."

A training approach to software that follows a cascade model in which the trainer of

the first group is trained in a particular skill or knowledge and, upon qualification, becomes the trainer of the second group (Jacobs, 2002). The purpose of technical instruction is to provide online instructional information and skills using software and its applications. Then the mentor applies it and guides PPG participants regarding the applications in the software. The result was that in applying the software to the participants, some participants admitted that they did not know about Education software. From the results of previous research, Elder (1996) stated that not all knowledge is needed to facilitate online learning but knowledge of software is needed which is often used in the world of education, especially when education goes online.

From this research it can be seen that software has an important role in the world of education, especially for students and students. Apart from that, in implementing online education programs, such as implementing PPG online, of course, participants are required to master the software because this will be useful for them in implementing PPG programs online.

# 3.2.1.1.2 Confused about Choosing Evaluation Questions

This study found that some participants felt confused in choosing questions for evaluating their students. For example, they have to choose evaluation questions in the form of essays, fill in the blanks, true-false or choice. Participants reported that they were confused and did not understand what evaluation questions were asked so that the evaluation results were relevant. As participant 7 said "from my experience making computer-based evaluation questions, I think one of the things that is really confusing is choosing the type of evaluation. What should be developed, whether it is a choice essay, fill in the blank, true or false, of course it will readjust to the computerbased material itself when it comes to choose questions. Basically, what I remember and know in compiling the evaluation must be valid and reliable, want to test the conditional sentence, so that the evaluation is related to the conditional sentence, so that it can be said to be valid?"

Other participants also expressed difficulties in choosing tools for evaluation questions. As participant 8 said, "I also experienced problems in learning evaluation. What tools should I use to date? Which is roughly." Participant 9 also said the same thing "I also feel challenged in choosing evaluation questions, sir, and here I try to use the Google form". From some of these opinions, the

results obtained were that the participants were confused and felt challenged in choosing an evaluation question tool to be entered into the CBT computer and were still unsure about the validity of the questions.

In making evaluation questions, the questions must be valid and relevant. according to Hamzah (2014: 11), a good assessment must be based on the learning objectives set by the teacher, of course the evaluation made must be valid and relevant then the teacher and students must really try to achieve it. Of course, the teacher formulates learning objectives to be achieved before they start learning. Therefore, evaluation must be based on the learning objectives that have been formulated before the learning process is carried out. In this case, of course, making valid and relevant evaluation questions must be based on a formula and not just made up.

From this study it can be concluded that valid and relevant evaluation questions must indeed be applied by participants because according to Sudjana (2017: 12), Validity is the determination of an assessment tool for the concept being assessed so that it really assesses what should be assessed. An evaluation tool that has a high level of validity means that the evaluation tool can be said to be valid, and vice versa, an evaluation tool cannot be said to be valid or less valid if it has a low level of validity.

### 3.2.2 Difficulties of Making Lesson Plans

In this study it was found that some participants admitted that they had difficulty in compiling lesson plans online. Many of them are used to compiling lesson plans offline (outside the network). So, they feel stiff and have difficulty in compiling lesson plans using software (online). As said by participant 10 "The newest thing for me is compiling all the tools for compiling lesson plans that are done online. Usually we, we make it for off-network for this online. The first thing that made it difficult for me was that I was new to applications like Google meet Google form and so on."

According to Mulyasa (2013), RPP is a curriculum whose development is related to certain Core Competencies (KD) in the curriculum/curriculum. The lesson plan is carried out together with the teacher's instructions in class so that the implementation can be guided according to the assigned KD. PPG participants who are used to preparing

lesson plans manually or offline (outside the network). So, they feel stiff and have difficulty in compiling lesson plans using software (online). Usually RPP is prepared manually, namely by handwriting, whereas in the technological era like now the preparation of RPP more often uses technology. The result is that along with the development of the era, participants who are rigid about this inevitably have to keep up with existing technological developments.

# **3.2.3** The Way of PPG Participants Solve Challenges

Previously, there were 4 challenges faced by PPG participants in participating in the online PPG program at Ganesha University of Education. These challenges are Lack of participants' ICT skills, teacher's ignorance of educational software, confused about choosing evaluation questions, and difficulties in preparing online lesson plans. From some of these challenges, participants found ways to solve the challenges they faced. These methods will be discussed as follows:

### 3.2.3.1 Lack of Participants' ICT Skills

In facing this challenge, the participants used the method by studying the use of technological tools through YouTube and discussing with colleagues who know more about this. As expressed by Mr. Alex Raden in his reflection "Before I didn't know how to edit a video then how to add the video to a YouTube account". Then Mrs. Dewinta Putri and Mrs. Dian Utama admitted that they were less skilled in using technology. Participants learn more through the YouTube application to overcome the challenges they face.

# **3.2.3.2** Teacher's Ignorance of Educational Software

The implementation of PPG online is of course related to software in which various applications are available that can be used to support the running of PPG online. These applications include Google Forms, Google Zoom, and Google Meet. PPG participants admitted that they were not very familiar with these applications, some of them did not even know anything about them. The way they use to solve these challenges is by contacting the mentor then the mentor will guide them in this matter. Then they will slowly apply what they have got from the mentor's guidance. Therefore, mentors have an important role in this regard.

# **3.2.3.3** Confused about Choosing Evaluation Ouestions

Participants admitted that they studied evaluation questions from YouTube and the internet. As stated by one of the representatives of the participants, Mrs. Dian Utama, "How many days have I learned this through YouTube". Therefore, they can make evaluation questions so that the results of the questions become relevant. YouTube is an application that is often used by participants to learn things they don't understand or don't understand.

# 3.2.3.4 Difficulties in Preparing Online Lesson Plans

Several participants admitted that they had difficulty in compiling lesson plans online. Many of them are used to compile lesson plans offline (outside the network). So, they feel stiff and have difficulty compiling lesson plans using software (online). PPG participants can successfully complete challenges by discussing with fellow colleagues, asking mentors for help, and searching via the internet and YouTube.

From the discussion above, it can be concluded that the method used by PPG participants to solve the challenges they face is by utilizing technology. Dominant participants search for things they don't understand or don't understand through the YouTube application, and Google/internet. Then they discuss it with their colleagues and of course this activity is under the guidance of a mentor to help them.

### IV. CONCLUSION

Drawing on the aforementioned literature, this study uncovered four obstacles to online Teacher Professional Education (PPG) for inservice teacher programs in Indonesia. Participant and teacher familiarity with various forms of information and communication technology, as well as assessment questions and online lesson planning, all pose obstacles. Furthermore, four elements that have the potential to impact teacher learning were also found in this study. These are mentor factors, participant factors, managerial factors, and facility factors. In every challenge there is a way to do it to solve the challenge. The dominant method used by PPG participants is with fellow colleagues, assistance via the internet and YouTube and of course also through mentor guidance. This has repercussions for the requirement for additional enhancements in the PPG program for teachers to be implemented in the office online.

### **REFERENCES**

- Akkerman, S. F. (2010). A Dialogical Approach to Conceptualizing Teacher Identity. Teacher and Teaching Education. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2010.08.013., 308-319.
- Altheide, D. L. (2011). Reflections on Interpretive Adequacy in Qualitative Research. *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research*, 581-594.
- Bako, A. J. (n.d.). Peluang dan Tantangan PPG bagi Mahasiswa Lulusan S1 Kependidikan.
- Çobanoğlu, Z. A. (2018). In-service Teacher Training: Problems of the Teachers as Learners. *International Journal of Instruction*, 159-174.
- Dasoo, N. &. (2020). Teacher Advocacy for the Enhancement of Professional Learning and Development in Continuous Professional Development Teacher Programmes. *South African Journal of Higher Education*, 45-49.
- Disciplines. (ICIRAD 2017). Advances in Social Science. *Education and Humanities*, Volume 134 (pp. 210–215). Paris, France.: Atlantis Press, Scientific.
- Holmes, B. (2013). School Teachers' Continuous Professional Development in an Online Learning Community: Lessons from a Case Study of an e-Twinning Learning Event. European Journal of Education, 97-113.
- Iqbal, N. M. (August 2018). Challenges Faced by Prospective Teachers during Teaching Practice: Connecting Theory to Practice. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, Vol. 40, No. 2 pp. 113-136.
- Khanare, P.-F. M. (December 2018). Challenges Experienced by Pre-Service Teachers in the Post-Graduate Certificate in Education Programme at a South African University.
- Andersson, K. S. (2022). Enhancing Teachers' Classroom Communication Skills Measuring the Effect of a Continued Professional Development Programme for Mainstream School Teachers. *Child Language Teaching and Theraphy*, doi: 10.1177/02656590211070997.
- Nurafnayanti Hidayat, N. D. (n.d.). Problematika dan Tantangan Profesi Guru.
- P, B. (2020). Neoliberal Governmentality in Global English Textbooks. *Classroom Discourse*, 149-163.
- Utami. (2017). Genuine Involvement in Continuous Professional Development: How to See It? In 2nd International Conference on Innovative Research Across, I. G. A. L. P.

- Utami, I. G. (2018). How English Teachers Learn in Indonesia: Tension between Policy-Driven and Self-Driven professional development. *Teflin*, 29(2), 245–265.
- Utami, I. L. (2017). Levels of Involvement in the English Teachers' CPD (Continuous Professional Development): The Degree of Professional Enthusiasm. *The Journal of Asia*, TEFL, 14(2), 336–345.