Comparative Analysis between Conventional Learning and Problem-Based Learning (PBL) in the Aspect of Understanding Indonesian Vocabulary

Arozatulo Bawamenewi[1], Riska Sri Handayani[2], Krisnawati Bate'e[3], Testing Ilmiah Gulo[4]

[1,2,3,4] Universitas Nias, Provinsi Sumatera Utara, Indonesia

Email: arozatulobawamenewi@unias.ac.id, riskatafonao1005@gmail.com, krisbatee00@gmail.com, Gulotety91@gmail.com

Abstract- Research shows that PBL, which places students as active subjects in learning by emphasizing problem solving, provides better results in improving vocabulary understanding compared to conventional learning. Students who engage in PBL tend to have higher scores because they are actively involved in the learning process, where they are faced with challenging problems and given the opportunity to find their own solutions. In an effort to increase the effectiveness of the learning process, the use of learning models is crucial. The right learning model plays an important role in achieving educational goals. The purpose of this article is to compare conventional learning models and Problem-Based Learning (PBL) in understanding Indonesian vocabulary. By using qualitative methods. However, there are several obstacles in implementing PBL, such as lack of familiarity of students and teachers with this model and time constraints. However, the effectiveness of a learning model does not only depend on the model itself, but is also influenced by various other factors such as student characteristics, the quality of teacher teaching, and school environmental conditions. Thus, selecting a learning model that suits students' needs and characteristics is the key to achieving effective learning goals and increasing understanding of Indonesian vocabulary.

Keywords: Comparative Analysis, Lonventional learning, Problem Based Learning, Learning Methods and Learning Strategies.

I. INTRODUCTION

Education is a complex system that covers various aspects of life. The educational process is not only limited to the transfer of knowledge, but also involves the development of practical skills, the formation of good character, and the development of critical and creative attitudes and ways of thinking. The rules applied in education aim to achieve optimal results and in accordance with the purpose of education itself. Education can take place in various contexts and environments, both formal such as in schools and universities, and informal such as at home and in the community. This flexibility in time and place allows education to continue throughout an individual's life, making it a continuous process.

The main purpose of education is to shape individuals who are able to face the challenges of life, both in personal and social contexts. Educated individuals are expected to be able to develop themselves, socialize well and contribute positively to the sustainability of society. They are also expected to have the ability to continue learning and adapting to the changing times. In

the context of education in Indonesia, Indonesian plays an important role as the main means of communication and as a subject at school. Indonesian language teaching aims to improve students' abilities in language, including reading, writing, listening and speaking skills. These skills are essential for students' academic and social success.

However, to achieve the desired results, an effective learning model is required. The right learning model can increase student engagement, facilitate deeper understanding, and encourage the application of knowledge in a real context. Conversely, inappropriate learning models can hinder the learning process and negatively affect student learning outcomes. Therefore, the selection and application of appropriate learning models is crucial to the success of education. Thus, education is a holistic process that covers various aspects and aims to develop quality individuals. The importance of Indonesian in the context of education in Indonesia suggests the need for effective learning models to ensure the success of the learning process and outcomes.

In language acquisition, input is a crucial and determining factor. Humans cannot master a language without comprehensive input. The mentalistic view posits that children are born with inherent capabilities for language learning. Additionally, there are universal concepts in language, allowing children to mentally recognize universal characteristics (Bawamenewi, 2020). Therefore, the use of models in learning activities is vital. An effective learning process is essential for achieving educational goals. The effectiveness of the learning process can vary between classes. The better the model, the more effective the achievement of learning objectives. Communication that involves conveying messages (information) to others using written language as a medium is known as writing (Salamah & Iriani, 2023). Writing is used for reporting, informing, and influencing. These purposes can only be effectively achieved by individuals who can organize their thoughts and express them clearly.

Student learning outcomes after the learning process can be measured as the quality of learning. Learning outcomes refer to changes in a person's behavior following instruction, whether at school or in the wider community, through the application of a learning model employed by the teacher. Cognitive learning outcomes specifically pertain to the knowledge aspect of learning activities and carry measurable value. The learning process is deemed successful if it brings about positive changes in students. If no such changes occur, the learning application is considered unsuccessful. Several factors can influence student learning outcomes. The 2013 curriculum emphasizes student activities over teacher-led instruction (Herman Wijaya & Fikri, 2019). This approach makes learning more interactive and student-centered. However, various issues can hinder this process. These include students' inadequate language skills, low interest in writing, and the predominance of conventional teaching methods that rely on lectures and note-taking. As a result, learning activities often remain teacher-centered, causing students to become passive and unmotivated in class.

Some characteristics of the conventional learning model include the following: learning materials are delivered to groups of learners in the classroom without consideration for individual needs, learning activities typically consist of lectures and written assignments, learners are generally passive as they must listen to the teacher's explanations, and the learning pace of the learners is often slow. According to the Big Indonesian Dictionary (KBBI), "conventional" means "attitudes and ways of thinking and acting that always adhere to norms and customs that have existed for generations." Therefore, conventional learning models can also be referred to as traditional learning models. From the explanation above, it can be concluded that the conventional model refers to the learning method employed during the research process, which involves studying and reading literature related to the research subject. The data used in this study came from books, scientific works, and research reports pertinent to the research subject.

The difference between conventional learning and problem-based learning in the context of Indonesian vocabulary comprehension lies in their approaches and effectiveness. Conventional learning methods for Indonesian vocabulary comprehension remain useful and important. However, these methods are not effective unless they are adapted to incorporate other learning models. Choosing the right learning model demonstrates the teacher's creativity, preventing learners from becoming bored or disengaged with the material. It also encourages continuous thinking and active participation. The primary drawback of the conventional learning model is its emphasis on

content recitation. Learners are not provided with sufficient time to critically think about the material, relate it to their prior knowledge, or apply it to real-life situations. Conventional learning is characterized by a lack of student interaction, teacher-centered instruction, and passive learning experiences (Nurhayati et al., 2015). In this model, teachers often dominate the learning process by providing materials and instructions, while students complete tasks or exercises to practice what they have learned.

Teaching in conventional learning is typically structured, involving lectures, reading texts, and other formal tasks. For Indonesian vocabulary comprehension, students might receive a list of words with definitions and example sentences. They are then tested through exercises prescribed by the teacher. This method focuses on rote memorization rather than fostering deeper understanding or practical application. While conventional learning methods have their place in education, they must be complemented with more dynamic and interactive approaches, such as problem-based learning, to enhance effectiveness and student engagement. Problem-based learning encourages critical thinking, problem-solving, and active participation, which are essential for meaningful vocabulary comprehension and overall learning success.

Problem-Based Learning (PBL), on the other hand, shifts the focus from the teacher to the students. In PBL, students are presented with challenging problems or situations that require solving. These problems are often complex and necessitate critical thinking and collaborative problem-solving. In the context of Indonesian vocabulary comprehension, problem-based learning might involve scenarios where students must use the vocabulary they are learning to understand and solve specific problems (Juliani, 2022). Students in PBL are encouraged to seek solutions independently or in groups, utilizing available resources such as textbooks, the internet, and group discussions. PBL also allows students to see how vocabulary is used in a broader context, which helps them understand concepts better and apply vocabulary in real situations.

After learning problem-solving skills, students are motivated to acquire further knowledge and apply their existing knowledge. When students encounter situations that require practical application of ideas, their learning becomes more meaningful and expansive.

Problem-Based Learning (PBL) enables learners to integrate their knowledge and skills, applying them in relevant contexts. Through collaborative group work, PBL enhances critical thinking skills, promotes teamwork, and nurtures interpersonal relationships among learners.

The study aims to assess the effectiveness of Problem-Based Learning (PBL) compared to conventional learning methods in enhancing students' understanding of Indonesian vocabulary. Specifically, it seeks to determine which approach conventional learning or PBL is more effective in facilitating learning and improving comprehension of Indonesian vocabulary. By conducting this comparison, the study aims to offer insights into the most suitable learning method that can yield optimal learning outcomes in the context of Indonesian vocabulary comprehension.

II. METHODS

The research employed a qualitative method with a descriptive approach to investigate students' proficiency in Indonesian Vocabulary Comprehension Aspects, Qualitative research is a research process that aims to understand human or social phenomena by producing a deep and complex picture that can be communicated in words, reporting detailed perspectives obtained from informant sources, and conducted in a natural environment (Walidin, Saifullah & Tabrani, 2015: 77). The study focused on students as subjects and aimed to assess their ability to comprehend Indonesian vocabulary. The research utilized several instruments to gather data. A vocabulary comprehension test was administered to measure students' understanding. Additionally, student involvement, contextual usage of vocabulary, creativity, and the effectiveness of learning methods were evaluated. Data collection involved the analysis of written tasks. Data analysis was conducted through various methods. Observations were made regarding how students utilized vocabulary in practice. Interviews and questionnaires were also employed to gather qualitative insights into students' comprehension and learning experiences. By employing a qualitative, descriptive approach, this research sought to provide a comprehensive understanding of students' proficiency in Indonesian vocabulary comprehension. The combination of assessment tools and data analysis techniques aimed to uncover insights into the effectiveness of different learning

methods and their impact on students' language learning abilities.

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The problem-based learning (PBL) model is one of the innovative learning models that can provide students with active learning conditions. Unlike traditional teaching methods, which often involve passive absorption of information through lectures, memorization, and note-taking, PBL engages students in a dynamic process of inquiry and problem-solving. In PBL, students are presented with complex, real-world problems without predefined solutions. This approach requires them to apply their knowledge and skills to identify the problem, research relevant information, and develop solutions. The process mirrors the stages of the scientific method, which includes: (1) Problem identification. Students begin by identifying and understanding the problem. This stage involves critical thinking and discussion to define the scope and nature of the problem. (2) Information gathering. After defining the problem, students gather information from various sources. This can include textbooks, academic journals, online databases, expert interviews, and more. The aim is to collect relevant data and insights that will help in solving the problem. (3) Hypothesis formulation. Based on the gathered information, students develop hypotheses or potential solutions. This stage encourages creative thinking and the application of theoretical knowledge to practical scenarios. (4) Experimentation and testing. Students test their hypotheses through experiments, simulations, or other investigative methods. This step allows them to evaluate the feasibility and effectiveness of their proposed solutions. (5) Analysis and conclusion. After testing, students analyze the results and draw conclusions. They discuss the outcomes, reflect on the process, and consider any modifications needed for their solutions. (6) Presentation and reflection. Finally, students present their findings and solutions to their peers or instructors. This presentation often involves creating reports, posters, or digital presentations. Reflection on the entire process is crucial for internalizing the learning experience and improving future problem-solving skills.

Through this process, students do not merely gain knowledge about the problem itself but also develop critical thinking, research, and collaboration skills. They learn to approach problems systematically and think independently. This method contrasts sharply with conventional learning models, which typically involve a more passive absorption of information, where students listen to lectures, memorize facts, and may only engage superficially with the material. In conventional learning, the emphasis is often on the retention of factual information, which can lead to rote memorization without deep understanding. Students might be able to recall facts for tests but may struggle to apply this knowledge in real-world contexts. PBL, on the other hand, emphasizes understanding over memorization. It teaches students how to learn and process information, equipping them with the skills to tackle new and unfamiliar problems effectively. Furthermore, PBL fosters a collaborative learning environment where students work in groups to solve problems. This teamwork not only enhances their learning experience but also prepares them for real-world scenarios where collaborative problem-solving is often essential.

The research demonstrated that students taught using the Problem-Based Learning (PBL) model exhibited different speaking skills compared to those taught with the conventional learning model. Notably, students who received instruction through the PBL model achieved higher overall scores than their peers who experienced traditional teaching methods. This disparity in performance can be attributed to the nature of the PBL model, which promotes active participation in all facets of the learning process.

In the PBL approach, problems that arise are utilized as tools to give students opportunities to acquire knowledge and skills that support their expertise. By being required to independently confront and solve these problems, students can identify their difficulties in understanding the subject matter and develop solutions to overcome them. This self-directed problem-solving experience is invaluable, as it ensures that learning is deeply embedded and personally meaningful for the students.

However, implementing the PBL model in teaching and learning, particularly in writing poetry, does not always proceed smoothly. Several obstacles can hinder the process. One significant challenge is the lack of familiarity with the PBL approach among both students and teachers. Many are still accustomed to the conventional model of one-way information delivery, which can make the transition to a more interactive and student-centered approach difficult.

Another significant impediment is the constraint of time. The PBL process often requires more time than traditional methods, as learners need adequate time to engage with and resolve the problems presented to them. This time requirement must be balanced with the constraints of the curriculum and other scheduling considerations, which can be challenging. Adjusting the implementation of PBL to fit within the allocated time frames while ensuring that the learning objectives are met remains a critical issue.

However, there are several factors that influence the success of learning both with the PBL (Problem-Based Learning) model and the conventional model. These factors include teachers, students, the availability of learning tools and media, and the condition of the school environment. All these factors support each other and influence how effective a learning method or model is: (1) Teachers. Teachers play a crucial role in determining the success of learning. The quality of teaching, understanding of the material, skills in managing the class, as well as the ability to motivate and guide students are important aspects. Teachers trained in the PBL model, for example, are able to facilitate a more interactive and problem-based learning process, while less competent teachers may struggle to implement this method effectively. (2) Students. Students' characteristics, including their motivation, interests, initial abilities, as well as learning skills, greatly influence learning outcomes. Students who are active, motivated and have critical thinking skills tend to be more successful in PBL learning, as this model demands active engagement and problem solving. Conversely, passive or less motivated students may be better suited to the more structured conventional learning model. (3) Availability of learning tools and media. Learning tools and media such as books, technology devices and other materials are very important in supporting the learning process. In PBL, the use of appropriate tools can help students understand and solve problems better. The availability of technology such as computers and internet access can also enrich the learning experience. Conversely, the lack of these resources can hinder the effectiveness of learning in both PBL and conventional models. And (4) school environment. The physical and social environment of the school is also significant. Schools that provide a conducive, safe and supportive environment for teaching and learning

will be more effective in implementing various learning models. Comfortable classroom conditions, adequate facilities and a positive school culture contribute to successful learning. All these factors interact and together determine how effective a learning model is. The effectiveness of a learning model can be measured through student achievement levels. Good student achievement reflects that the learning method used is effective. In this context, a well-implemented PBL model will show improvement in critical thinking, problem-solving and deep understanding of the material, while an effective conventional model may show more improvement in mastery of the material and basic skills. Thus, successful learning does not depend on just one factor, but a combination of various factors that support and complement each other. This emphasizes the importance of a holistic approach in education, where all aspects that influence learning are considered and optimized to achieve the best results for students.

IV. CONCLUSION

The problem-based learning (PBL) model is one of the innovative learning models that can provide students with active learning conditions. In this case, students are asked to be actively involved in solving problems through the stages of the scientific method. This is done so that students can gain knowledge and skills to solve problems in addition to gaining knowledge about the problem. Conventional learning conditions students to listen, memorize, and learn, including asking questions. By conducting this comparison, the study aims to evaluate which of the two learning models is more effective in facilitating the learning process and increasing students' understanding of Indonesian vocabulary using qualitative methods. Nonetheless, there are some obstacles in the implementation of PBL, such as students' and teachers' lack of familiarity with this model as well as time constraints. However, the effectiveness of a learning model does not only depend on the model itself, but is also influenced by various other factors such as student characteristics, teacher teaching quality, and school environmental conditions. Thus, the selection of a learning model that suits the needs and characteristics of students is key in achieving effective learning objectives and improving the comprehension of Indonesian vocabulary.

REFERENCES

Asfar, A. M. I. T., & Asfar, A. M. I. A. (2021). LANDASAN PENDIDIKAN: HAKIKAT DAN TUJUAN PENDIDIKAN (FOUNDATION OF EDUCATION: ESSENCE AND EDUCATIONAL OBJECTIVES). Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan Home Current Archives Annou, 6(1).

Bawamenewi, Arozatulo. 2020. "PEMEROLEHAN BAHASA ANAK USIA TIGA TAHUN PADA TATARAN FONOLOGI: ANALISIS PSIKOLINGUISTIK." Jurnal Review Pendidikan dan Pengajaran 3(1):145–54. doi: 10.31004/jrpp.v3i1.1303.

Herman Wijaya, and Zul Fikri. 2019. "Pengaruh Problem Based Learning (PBL) Terhadap Kemampuan Menulis Puisi Siswa Kelas VII MTS. Hizbul Wathan Semaya." Bahasa: Jurnal Keilmuan Pendidikan Bahasa dan Sastra Indonesia 1(3):149–58. doi: 10.26499/bahasa.v1i3.7.

Juliani, Reni. 2022. "Penggunaan Model Pembelajaran Berbasis Masalah (Problem Based Learning) dalam Menyajikan Gagasan Kreatif Berbentuk Teks Cerita Fantasi dan Pengaruhnya Terhadap Sikap Kreatif Peserta Didik Kelas VII H SMP Negeri 4 Pangalengan." Wistara: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa dan Sastra 3(2):186–97. doi: 10.23969/wistara.v3i2.3740.

Kristyanawati, Martanti Dwi, Sarwiji Suwandi, and Muhammad Rohmadi. 2019. "Peningkatan Keterampilan Menulis Teks Eksposisi Menggunakan Model Problem Based Learning." Scholaria: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan 9(2):192–202. doi: 10.24246/j.js.2019.v9.i2.p192-202.

Nurhayati, Fitri, Joko Widodo, and Etty Soesilowati. 2015. "PENGEMBANGAN LKS BERBASIS PROBLEM BASED LEARNING (PBL) POKOK BAHASAN TAHAP PENCATATAN AKUNTANSI PERUSAHAAN." Journal of Economic Education.

Prabowo, Wiryo Hadi Gusti, Sri Suneki, and Filia Prima Artharina. 2023. "Analisis Model PBL pada Muatan Pelajaran Bahasa Indonesia di SDN Sambirejo 02 Semarang." 7.

Salamah, Annisa Us, and Tuti Iriani. 2023. "KOMPARASI MODEL PEMBELAJARAN PROBLEM BASED LEARNING (PBL) DAN MODEL PEMBELAJARAN KONVENSIONAL PADA MATA KULIAH STRUKTUR BETON 2: TINJAUAN LITERATUR TERHADAP HASIL BELAJAR MAHASISWA." 1.

Srimulat, F. E. (2024). TEORI-TEORI PENDIDIKAN (E. Susetyarini (ed.); 1st ed.). Widina Media Utama.

Walidin, W., Saifullah, & Tabrani. (2015). Metodologi penelitian kualitatif & grounded theory. FTK Ar-Raniry Press